



The United Nations Universal Periodic Review - Second Cycle

Joint Statement by:

The Children's Rights Alliance for England

and

Together

Prioritisation of UPR recommendations and desired actions for follow-up by the UK Government in relation to 2nd round UPR recommendations

September 2013

1. About Us

The Children's Rights Alliance for England (CRAE):

CRAE is a membership body for organisations and individuals committed to our overarching aim: the full implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC). CRAE's vision is of a society where the human rights of all children are recognised and realised.

CRAE is the leading organisation working to promote children's rights in England. It protects the human rights of children by lobbying government and others who hold power, by bringing or supporting test cases, and by using national and international human rights mechanisms.

CRAE provides free legal information, raises awareness of children's rights, and undertakes research about children's access to their rights.

CRAE mobilises others, including children and young people, to take action to promote and protect children's human rights.

Each year CRAE publishes a review of the state of children's rights in England. This provides a non-governmental perspective on the progress made in England towards implementing the UNCRC.

Together:

Together (formerly known as the Scottish Alliance for Children's Rights) seeks the full implementation of the UNCRC in Scotland.

With over 230 members throughout Scotland, Together's aims are to:

- Promote the importance of children's rights in order to highlight issues of concern to policy makers, the media and the general public, and to disseminate information on the UNCRC:
- Establish links with statutory agencies and other bodies to ensure the monitoring and promotion of the full implementation of the UNCRC in Scotland, through policy and legislative mechanisms and good practice;
- Provide a focal point for non-governmental organisations in Scotland on children's rights issues, and in the preparation of reports to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child on the progress of the UK governments in implementing the UNCRC.

Each year Together publishes a review of the state of children's rights in Scotland. This provides a non-governmental perspective on the progress made in Scotland towards implementing the UNCRC.

CRAE Paola Uccellari Director

Tel: +44 (0) 207 278 8222 <u>PUccellari@crae.org.uk</u> Together Juliet Harris Director

Tel: +44 (0) 131 229 3666 juliet@togetherscotland.org.uk

2. Background

This submission is a joint submission by CRAE and Together, UK non-governmental organisations (NGOs) with a particular interest in the protection and promotion of children's rights.

This submission is a response to the Ministry of Justice's call for views on the final UPR recommendations that the UK Government should prioritise in its mid-term report or on areas not included in the UPR's recommendations.

We welcome the opportunity to make this submission to the Government in advance of its mid-term report to the UPR. In putting together this submission we have reviewed the UK Government's response of September 2012 to the UPR report. We highlight as in need of priority those recommendations made by the UPR which relate, either specifically or more generally, to the protection of children's rights.

Generally, while we welcome the fact the Government has accepted many of the UPR's recommendations, we believe that the Government should prioritise setting out the concrete and specific steps it will take to implement these and the other recommendations affecting children. We therefore set out, in relation to each of the recommendations affecting children, the concrete actions we would expect the Government to take in order to implement the same. These relate mainly, although not exclusively, to the UPR recommendations it has accepted.

3. Recommendations to be Prioritised and Desired UK Government Action

UPR recommendation	Accepted?	UK Government response	Desired UK Government action
CRC General Measures of Implementation			
110.5 Consider an early ratification of the newest international human rights instrument – the Third Optional Protocol to the CRC on a communications procedure (Slovakia)	Yes	The UK Government is considering the merits of the new Optional Protocol for the whole of the UK, taking into account of the views of the devolved administrations and in light of how it will be applied in practice. The Government will consider signing the Optional Protocol when it has fully evaluated its merits for the UK.	Objective: UK ratification of the 3 rd Optional Protocol 1) The Government sets in motion a clear, transparent and participative process for its consideration 'of the merits of the new Optional Protocol for the whole of the UK' with a clear timeframe in place for decision. This should also involve direct consultation with the devolved nation governments. This should start with immediate effect with a decision prior to submission of the Government's report to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (January 2014).
110.9 Incorporate fully, as a matter of urgency, the principles and provisions of the CRC into domestic law (Slovakia)	No	The UK Government is fully committed to the promotion and implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. The Convention does not itself require states to incorporate its provisions directly into domestic law. The UK's approach to ensuring it meets its obligations under the UNCRC is, accordingly, to pursue implementation by means of a combination of legislative	Objective: Incorporation of the UNCRC into domestic law 1) Through a Government amendment to the Children and Families Bill introduce a public sector child rights duty as a first step towards broader legal implementation of the UNCRC. 2) Publish ongoing documented evidence of how the UK Government is meeting its December 2010 commitment to

and policy initiatives, in keeping with general practice in the UK.

In December 2010 the UK Government gave a commitment to Parliament to give due consideration to the UNCRC when making new policy and legislation. It is also introducing new legislation to strengthen the role of the Children's Commissioner for England, so that it is able to promote and protect the rights of children in line with the UNCRC. The new legislation also includes giving the commissioner new powers to carry out impact assessments of new policies and legislation on children's rights.

Legislation is also in preparation in Scotland with a view to strengthening support for children and placing their rights at the heart of Scotland's devolved policies.

In Wales, there is difference in approach. In 2011 the Welsh Government introduced legislation which places a duty on Welsh Ministers to have due regard to the UNCRC and its optional protocols when making decisions about proposed new policies and or legislation.

'give due consideration to the UNCRC' and complying with Cabinet Office¹ Guidelines on producing legislation by publishing an Explanatory Note to all new legislation which sets out how the Bill's provisions are compliant with the UNCRC.

This would also compliment the Cabinet Office 'open policy making' initiative included in its draft Open Government Partnership Action Plan (due to be launched in October 2013).

3) Clarify, within the child rights strategy noted below, UK Government plans to ensure that consideration of children's rights – and further, protection for children's rights – is consistent across the four nations of the UK given the development of discrete legislation in Wales and Scotland to enshrine the UNCRC in law.

¹ Cabinet Office (July 2013) Guide to Making Legislation Page 96

Then from May 2014 whenever they use any of their legal powers or duties.	
The UK Government is fully committed to the promotion and implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and ensures that its policies and legislation complies with it. The education, health and wellbeing of children are vital for our society and the principles and standards defined in the Convention are an important framework for our thinking. Wales In Wales, the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure places a duty on Welsh Ministers to have due regard to the CRC when reviewing their policies and when making decisions about proposed policies or legislation. From 1st May 2012. Scotland The Scottish Government assured a commitment to enshrining the principles of the Convention into domestic law and policy wherever possible. However it was stated that at present, wholesale incorporation of the UNCRC into domestic law is not the best approach to	rough a Government amendment to the Children and ilies Bill introduce a public sector child rights duty. Evelop a child rights strategy and action plan for and (and UK non-devolved policy areas) which ides clear, resourced, time-bound actions and a esponding monitoring framework. It must be eloped in partnership with key stakeholders, including fren, and include actions which address the mmendations of the UN Committee on the Rights of Child and other Treaty monitoring bodies in their cluding Observations on the UK and mmendations arising from the UPR process. Liblish ongoing documented evidence of how the UK ernment is meeting its December 2010 commitment to e due consideration to the UNCRC' and complying Cabinet Office Guidelines on producing legislation by ishing an Explanatory Note to all new legislation the sets out how the Bill's provisions are compliant the UNCRC. Would also compliment the Cabinet Office 'open cy making' initiative included in its draft Open ernment Partnership Action Plan (due to be launched ctober 2013).

preferable.	4) Structures should be established which ensure effective co-ordination and monitoring of UNCRC implementation, for example, a cross-cutting children's rights unit with adequate authority and resources and a formal children's rights stakeholders forum to ensure that civil society can work effectively with government in monitoring CRC implementation. This should also include clear co-ordination process with devolved governments and local authorities.
	5) Develop an adequately resourced UNCRC training action plan in order to ensure awareness and understanding across Whitehall and establish CRC leads within each Government department.
	6) To complement the above, carry out and publish a Child Rights Impact Assessment (CRIA) for all new policy proposals and budgetary decisions (again linked to Cabinet Office OPM initiative) to ensure the impact on children's rights and well-being is considered (and policies changed/amended/adapted accordingly) at the earliest possible stage.
	7) Building on its 2010 mapping document ² , commission an independent review which will show compatibility of current legislation with UNCRC standards and include in the children's rights strategy a plan to bring incompatible UK law in line with the requirements of the UNCRC.
	8) Working with HM Treasury, establish transparent and

² Department for Children, Schools and Families (2010) The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child: How legislation underpins legislation in England

participatory budgetary decision-making processes, including the publication of a CRIA, (linked to the OPM Cabinet Office initiative) and work towards publishing disaggregated budgets, which show spend on children.

- 9) A clear set of child rights indicators should be developed and adequate disaggregated data on all children, including the most marginalised, should be collected and published with a view to progressing the UNCRC. Data should also include information that reflects the views of children on how well their rights are being realised.
- 10) All professionals working with and for children must receive statutory, pre and post qualifying ongoing training on children's rights.
- 11) Ensure the Children's Commissioner for England fully meets the Paris Principles and standards set by the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child.
- 12) Participation: Introduce systems in central Government to ensure that the involvement of and consultation with children in government policy development is systemic and meaningful in line with Article 12 of the UNCRC and introduce legislation and guidance to ensure the involvement of children in decisions affecting them in line with Article 12.
- 13) Access to justice: children have legal standing, a right to an advocate and access to sufficient legal aid to challenge decisions which breach their rights.

			14) The Scottish Government must use the upcoming Children and Young People (Scotland) Bill as a crucial opportunity to ensure that the principles of the UNCRC become a reality for all children and young people in Scotland. The Scottish Government's policy intentions to 'make rights real' would be best realised through the full incorporation of the UNCRC into Scots Law. 15) The Scottish Government should seize the opportunity through the Children and Young People (Scotland) Bill to ensure the routine use of Child Rights Impact Assessments promoting a systematic approach to considering the UNCRC throughout Government, in all legislation and decision-making.
Continue to ensure that human rights principles are integrated in domestic laws (Qatar)	YES	The UK already ensures rights and fundamental freedoms in the European Convention on Human Rights are and continue to be enshrined in our domestic laws. Section 19 of the Human Rights Act (Statements of Compatibility) requires a Government Minister introducing legislation to Parliament to make a statement either that in his view the provisions of the legislation are compatible with the Convention rights or that if he is unable to make such a statement he nevertheless wishes Parliament to proceed with the legislation. This approach ensures that human rights principles are central to the	Objective: The Human Rights Act is safeguarded and UNCRC incorporation is taken forward 1) Through a Government amendment to the Children and Families Bill introduce a public sector child rights duty. Publish ongoing documented evidence of how the UK Government is meeting its December 2010 commitment to 'give due consideration to the CRC' and complying with Cabinet Office Guidelines on producing legislation by publishing an Explanatory Note to all new legislation which sets out how the Bill's provisions are compliant with the UNCRC. 2) The Government makes a commitment not to repeal or amend the Human Rights Act post 2015 and publically

consideration of domestic laws.

In addition, on 18th March 2011, in line with a commitment made in the Coalition Government's *Programme for Government*, the Government announced the establishment of an independent Commission to look afresh at the way rights are protected in the UK.

The Commission's terms reference are to investigate the creation of a UK Bill of Rights that incorporates and builds on all our obligations under the European Convention on Human Rights, to ensure that these rights continue to be enshrined in UK law, and protects and extends our liberties. The objective is to examine the operation and implementation of these obligations, and consider ways to promote a better understanding of the true scope of these obligations and liberties. The Commission has been asked to report by the end of 2012.

recognises the powerful protection that it provides for children's civil and political rights.

- 3) Any move to introduce a UK Bill of Rights builds upon and does not dilute current human rights protection incorporated into domestic law (meaning Human Rights Act + both in terms of the rights protected and the mechanisms through which they are protected).
- 4) The Governments talks accurately about the Human Rights Act and establishes a strategy to proactively counter inaccurate reporting and beliefs relating to human rights and the Human Rights Act.

Adopt measures necessary to ensure the independence of the Commissioners in accordance with the Paris Principles (Costa Rica)	YES	The UK Government is committed to having a strong and effective 'A'-rated National Human Rights Institution. The UK Government is liaising closely with the International Co-ordinating Committee and the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on the implementation of our reforms, which we believe will support the Commission, ensuring its independence and safeguarding its 'A'-rated status. This is a high priority for the UK Government. The Government also favours a strong independent Commissioner to represent the views and interests of children and to protect their rights. The proposed legislation for England set out in recommendation 110.38 will enhance the Commissioner's role.	Objective: To have a reformed Children's Commissioner for England that fully meets the standards set out in the Paris Principles and by the UN Committee 1)The Government tables amendments to the Children and Families Bill to provide for: A statement of the Commissioner's independence from Government; adequate involvement of Parliament in appointments, dismissals and setting the Commissioner's budget; a duty to report on how it has taken children's views into account; adequate resources; the definition of vulnerable children to include separated children and children in custody. The Government should also provide assurances on the floor of the house in relation to the extent of the primary functions of the Children's Commissioner.
110.37 Ensure that the reform process of the Equality and Human Rights Commission does not affect its independence in conformity with the Paris Principles (Morocco)	Yes	As above	Objective: To have an Equality and Human Rights Commission that conforms to the Paris Principles and, working in partnership with the Children's Commissioner, is a strong champion for children's rights 1) The Government makes a public commitment to the Equality and Human Rights Commission's independence and statutory framework and ensures it has adequate resources to carry out its role effectively.

Introduce legislation at the earliest opportunity to give the Children's Commissioner for England an explicit role of promoting and protecting children's rights in line with the CRC and to make the Commissioner more independent from Government and more accountable to Parliament (Australia)	YES	The UK Government is introducing legislation which will give the Children's Commissioner for England an explicit role to promote and protect children's rights and to make the commissioner more independent. The proposals are currently going through pre-legislative scrutiny with the aim of introducing a Bill early in 2013.	Objective: To have a reformed Children's Commissioner for England that fully meets the standards set out in the Paris Principles and by the UN Committee 1)The Government tables amendments to the Children and Families Bill to provide for: A statement of the Commissioner's independence from Government; adequate involvement of Parliament in appointments, dismissals and setting the Commissioner's budget; a duty to report on how it has taken children's views into account; adequate resources; the definition of vulnerable children to include separated children and children in custody. The Government should also provide assurances on the floor of the house in relation to the extent of the primary functions of the Children's Commissioner.
Basic health and Welfare			
110.41 Set out a clear pathway to meet the goal of ending child poverty in the UK by 2020 as stated in the Coalition's programme for government (Norway)	YES	The UK Government published its first strategy to meet the goal of ending Child Poverty in the UK by 2020 in April 2011, as required by the Child Poverty Act. The strategy is being implemented through Welfare Reform and the introduction of Universal Credit; the introduction of free education for all 3 and 4 year olds and for 40% of all 2-year olds; the establishment of the Social Mobility and Child Poverty Commission; and the introduction of the Pupil	Objective: The UK Government meets the targets on ending child poverty set out in the Child Poverty Act and takes action to close the attainment gap between children living in poverty and their peers 1) Ensure working age benefits keep pace with increases in the cost of living and increases in pay. 2) Tackle low pay through increases in the minimum wage and by pushing for adoption of the living wage by employers and by making a commitment to pay all public servants the living wage.

Premium, among other measures.

Scotland
The Scottish Government stated that

annual reports are produced by the Government to monitor progress towards

the four UK child poverty targets and on

actions under the main aims (maximising household resources and improving

children's wellbeing and life chances) of

the Child Poverty Strategy

4) Improve Universal Credit so all recipients face improved work incentives under the new welfare system.

5) Commit to the relative income measure of child poverty.

6) Ring-fence the Pupil Premium.

7) Ring-fence early intervention funding.

Objective: The Scottish Government set a clear pathway and investment programme to meet its commitment to eradicate child poverty by 2020

1) The Scottish Government should invest in Child Tax Credits and benefits so that levels of child poverty do not increase.

2) In-work poverty should be reduced and the Scottish Government must ensure that employment is an effective route out of poverty by allocating the resources needed to create clear work incentives for parents so that they keep more of their earnings.

3) The Scottish Government should make public its plans to reduce the effects of the current welfare reforms on

CRC General Measures of Implementation			children and young people and complete a thorough assessment of the impact of austerity on children's services, ensuring that the UNCRC is a key consideration in all decisions regarding welfare reform.
110.46 Adopt and implement a concrete plan of action realizing recommendations of treaty bodies and UN human rights mechanisms, and international human rights obligations (Islamic Republic of Iran)	YES	The UK Government believes consultation with civil society is a vital part of the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) process and other human rights treaty mechanisms. The Ministry of Justice, as the department with responsibility for domestic human rights policy, is consulting across the UK Government, with the Devolved Administrations and civil society to determine the best approach to developing a framework for monitoring implementation of the UPR recommendations that enjoy the support of the UK and observations from treaty monitoring bodies the UK is party to. Scotland The Scottish Government has had initial discussions with the Scottish Human Rights Commission regarding their call for a Scottish Human Rights Action Plan. The Scottish Government is supportive	Objective: A comprehensive child rights action plan is in place with the necessary resource and monitoring structures and framework 1) Develop a child rights strategy and action plan for England (and non-devolved policy areas) and UK, which includes clear, resourced, time-bound actions and a corresponding monitoring framework. It must be developed in partnership with key stakeholders, including children, and include actions which address the recommendations of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child and other Treaty Monitoring Bodies in their Concluding Observations on the UK and those arising from the UPR process.

	of an action plan in principle, and are considering further how they might engage further with this initiative.	
On the basis of the UK's commitment to the rule of law, comply with the rulings of the European Court of Human Rights on the cases concerning the United Kingdom, as well as promote the participation and cooperation of the European Union and its Member States with the Court (Mexico)	The recommendation enjoys the support of the United Kingdom. The UK is committed to the European Convention on Human Rights and to honouring its obligations under the Convention. As underlined in the latest annual report published by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe covering 2011, ³ the UK's overall record on the implementation of judgments continues to be a strong one. At 31 December 2011, according to the statistics in the annual report, the UK was responsible for a relatively low number of pending cases before the Committee of Ministers (40 cases), representing 0.37% of the overall total. Generally, the UK's approach to the implementation of judgments has been timely and effective and the action taken to address issues highlighted by the ECtHR has usually been shown to be effective. At the same time, the UK	Objective: Rulings relating to children's rights violation are complied with in a timely manner 1) The Government should ensure it complies with rulings of the European Court of Human rights concerning violations of children's rights on a timely manner.

³ The Committee of Ministers 5th annual report *Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights*, published in April 2012 and covering the year 2011: http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/execution/Documents/Publications_en.asp

General principles		
	This work should promote the participation and cooperation of all of the High Contracting Parties to the European Convention on Human Rights with the Court and not just be limited to the European Union Member States.	
	national level, which should mean that fewer cases are considered by the Court. Fewer cases should mean that the Court is able to focus more on the important cases and do so more quickly.	
	Declaration. The net effect of the measures in the Declaration should be that more cases are resolved at the	
	2012, the UK took an active lead to deliver a substantial package of reform to the Court, set out in the Brighton	
	During its Chairmanship of the Council of Europe from November 2011 to May	
	This is a consequence of the complexity of the issues raised in such cases	
	which progress towards implementation will not be as rapid as in other cases.	
	particularly sensitive and difficult areas in	

110.49	YES	This recommendation has already been	Objective: Legislation fully protects children from
	123	This recommendation has already been	
Review national		implemented. Following a thorough	<u>discrimination</u>
legislation to ensure		review, the Equality Act 2010 recently	
equality and non-		replaced all previous anti-discrimination	1) The Equality Act 2010 should be amended so that it
discrimination (Egypt)		laws with a single Act. The Act also	fully protects under-18s from age discrimination in all
		strengthened protection in some	areas of life falling within the scope of the Act.
		situations. The Act covers nine	3
		protected characteristics: age, disability,	2) The Government should make a public commitment to
		gender reassignment, marriage and civil	the Public Sector Equality Duty which requires public
		partnership, pregnancy and maternity,	
			bodies to have due regard to the need to eliminate
		race, religion or belief, sex and sexual	discrimination, advance equality of opportunity and foster
		orientation. The Equality Act prohibits	good relation between different people when carrying out
		direct and indirect discrimination,	their activities.
		harassment, victimisation and failing to	
		make a reasonable adjustment for a	
		disabled person. It prohibits unfair	
		treatment in the workplace, when	
		providing goods, facilities and services,	
		when exercising public functions, in the	
		disposal and management of premises,	
		in education and by associations (such	
		`	
		as private clubs).	
		The Act also contains the public sector	
		Equality Duty which requires public	
		bodies to have due regard to the need to	

⁴ The National Assembly for Wales has legislative competence over equal opportunities in respect of public bodies exercising devolved functions in Wales. Under the Equality Act 2010 Welsh Ministers also have regulation making powers to impose specific public sector equality duties on public authorities in Wales.

		eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity, and foster good relations between different people when carrying out their activities. Wales The Equality Act 2010 (Statutory Duties) (Wales) Regulations 2011 ⁴ require appropriate arrangements to be put in place for assessing the equality impact of policies and practices. As with all public authorities in Wales, the Welsh Government is required to carry out equality impact assessments across all of the protected characteristics. Part of this is about assessing the impact that policies and actions may have on the people of Wales.	
110.50 Continue stepping up its efforts in tackling discrimination and inequality for all its citizens (Indonesia)	YES	The UK Government's vision for equality is set out in the cross Government Equality Strategy 'Building a Fairer Britain' published in December 2010. The strategy sets out the government's commitment to tackling discrimination and removing the barriers to equal opportunities and social mobility. Current priorities include: maximising	Objective: Legislation fully protects children from age discrimination and the UNCRC Committee's recommendation to take urgent measures to address the intolerance of children within society 1) The Equality Act 2010 should be amended so that it fully protects under-18s from age discrimination. 2) The Government should make a public commitment to

⁵ http://wales.gov.uk/topics/equality/equalityactatwork/;jsessionid=jZt4QyWhHjGJz9SY2M68QhLdJJQjPGN2v8schLjQJRKgnjvs3w2Y!-1144266743?lang=en

	women's contribution; changing culture and removing barriers; and promoting simplification, reform and support. Wales	the Public Sector Equality Duty which requires public bodies to have due regard to the need to eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity and foster good relation between different people when carrying out their activities.
	The Welsh Government Strategic Equality Plan was published in 2012 ⁵ It has outcome-focused equality objectives which put the spotlight on the practical differences we need to make to people's lives. Objectives are based on the robust evidence that Welsh public bodies (including the Welsh Government itself) have gathered, and on engagement with organisations and individuals. Unlike previous equality duties, public authorities need to say why an action needs to be taken, the desired outcome, what is going to be delivered, by when and how it will be achieved.	3) National and local government should proactively promote positive images of children and young people and counter negative stereotyping.
Special Protection Measures	and now it will be defined a.	

110.44 Take further measures for the promotion and protection of human rights, including those of migrants (Nepal)	YES	The Scottish Government works closely with, and provides funding to, the Scottish Refugee Council, a strategic partner in this area, to ensure those seeking asylum and refugee protection in Scotland are welcomed and supported.	Objective: Improve the support for migrant and asylum seeking children in Scotland. 1) Work with COSLA to continue to support the roll-out of the new age assessment guidance and monitor and evaluate its use; 2) Take steps to ensure that sufficient high quality specialised legal representation is in place for children seeking asylum and for protecting and representing the victims of child trafficking; 3) Ensure that the guidance on age assessment introduced by the Scottish Refugee Council is adequately funded and resourced.
Increase efforts to combat trafficking in persons, particularly to protect women and children (Spain)	YES	The UK Government is increasing its efforts to combat trafficking in persons through the UK Government's human trafficking strategy and in implementing the EU Directive on trafficking in human beings. This is done in partnership with the Devolved Administrations and others. Scotland The Scottish Government has changed the law and provided resources to meet	Objective: Trafficked children have their rights fully respected 1) A system of guardianship for separated children should be introduced. 2) Responsibility for trafficked children should be moved to the Department for Education from the Home Office. 3) An independent Rapporteur on trafficking should be established to monitor the Government's response to trafficking and to ensure robust data collection on trafficking.

European standards and assist enforcement and prosecution and are supportive of opting into and implementing the EU Directive on trafficking in human beings. The Scottish Government is not convinced that the appointment of a Rapporteur would add value to the UK's fight against human trafficking and is concerned that it would add an additional layer of bureaucracy that may actually hamper its efforts to combat this crime. An IDMG is in place to coordinate and oversee our progress.

- 4) Children should have a statutory right of appeal in relation to decisions on their trafficking status.
- 5) Children should have access to sufficient legal aid to challenge decisions in relation to their trafficking status and in relation to decisions made by public authorities involving their welfare, immigration status and age assessments.
- 6) All frontline practitioners should be adequately trained in the identification and safeguarding of trafficked children in order to reduce the number of children going missing from care.
- 7) Children should not be prosecuted for criminal activities that they have been compelled to commit as a direct consequence of having been trafficked.
- 8) Scotland should actively look for trends and learning in the Scottish Guardianship Service and Legal Services Agency project and utilise this to create better identification and protection systems for trafficked children.
- 9) The Scottish Government should keep abreast of discussions held at the Cross Party Group and consider the group as a useful vehicle to push forward many of the unresolved and complicated issues.

			 10) The responses to the consultation for the Human Trafficking (Scotland) Bill should be fully considered and any consensus built upon. 11) Scotland's guidance 'Safeguarding Children in Scotland who may have been Trafficked should be updated. 12) The Scottish Government must ensure that it is in full compliance with the provisions of the EU Directive.
Reconsider its position about the continued legality of corporal punishment of children (Sweden)	NO	Keeping children safe is a top priority for the UK Government, which is absolutely clear that no child should be subjected to violence or abuse. The law in the UK only permits physical punishment of children in very limited circumstances. Corporal punishment is unlawful in state and full-time independent schools, in nursery and childminding settings, children's homes and secure establishments. In any setting, an assault on a child that results in injuries that are more than transient or trifling would normally be charged as an assault occasioning actual or grievous bodily harm. Where that is the case, the assault cannot be defended on the basis that it	Objective: The UK Government accepts and meets its obligations under article 19 UNCRC by fully outlawing corporal punishment 1) The UK Government commits to fully outlawing corporal punishment and establishes a timetable for taking its commitment forward in the children's rights action plan and strategy. 2) Funding is continued for positive parenting programmes and information. 3) The UK Government works together with Overseas territories and Crown Dependencies to fully outlaw corporal punishment.

that it is in breach of the UNCRC with regard to physical punishment; and believe that UK is compliant with Articles 19 and 37 in relation to abuse and violence towards children.	
Take measures to ensure the freedom of children from physical punishment in accordance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Norway)	
110.80 Introduce a ban on all corporal punishment of children as recommended by the CRC and other treaty bodies (Finland) 110.87 NO See recommendation 110.78 As above As above Objective: Article 37 of the UNCRO	

Take concrete steps to further reduce overcrowding of prisons, including through the increased application of alternative sentencing for juvenile offenders (Austria) modernising the custodial estate with 2,500 efficient and good quality places being delivered in 2012, at two new purpose-built prisons, HMP Thameside and HMP Oakwood. Since 2010 we have closed over 800 old and inefficient prison places and reduced crowding in private sector prisons by over 400 places.

This sits alongside plans to introduce more effective sentencing and rehabilitation policies to break the destructive cycle of crime. Plans for reforming sentencing, if successfully implemented, are expected to stabilise the prison population over the next four years. There is a discrete juvenile justice system in operation in England and Wales that includes specialised youth Courts, youth custodial establishments and Youth Offending Teams who work with and supervise young people who have offended. Where criminal offences are committed by juveniles there are a range of out-of-court disposals that can be used as an alternative to prosecution in court if this is in the public interest. Disposals such as warnings and youth conditional cautions allow rehabilitative and reparative activities to take place without prosecution. Restorative Justice

- 1) The Government takes concrete steps to ensure that children only receive custodial sentences as a matter of last resort and for the shortest possible time by raising the custody threshold. Short term sentences for children should be abolished.
- 2) The Government diverts children out of the criminal justice system by raising the minimum age of criminal responsibility.
- 3. The Government commits, in its response to the *Transforming Youth Custody* consultation, to ensuring that those few children who are placed in custody are held in small, local institutions appropriate for their care and rehabilitation, which are able to assess and meet all of a child's needs, staffed by well-trained and qualified multidisciplinary teams.
- 3) In relation to the treatment of children in custody, the Government must act to reduce restraint, segregation, self-harm, suicide and strip-searching and must ban the use of painful restraint techniques on children in custody.
- 4) Children should have access to adequate legal aid to allow them to challenge breaches of their rights in relation to custodial sentences and whilst in custody.

approaches are used as an alternative to the juvenile justice system and in addition to formal disposals and court sentences.

Custody for juveniles remains an option of last resort and should be used only for the most serious and persistent offenders. For example courts are required by statute to consider a youth rehabilitation order with a high intensity requirement as a specified alternative to custody when the custody threshold is reached for an under 18. If they still consider custody is warranted then they must explain in open court why a youth rehabilitation order is not appropriate.

Scotland

The Scottish Government continues to invest in a fit-for-purpose prison estate as well as introducing a range of reforms to help reduce the prison population and reoffending. As an alternative to custody, the Scottish Government has introduced the Community Payback Order as well as presumption against sentences of 3 months or less, and are working closely with key partners through a joint working group which seeks to delver continued improvement in this area.

General Measures of			
Implementation			
110.91	YES IN	As set out in response to	Objective: In line with the GMIs, adequate data on all
110.91	PART	As set out in response to recommendation 110.60 above, the UK	children who are victims of hate crime is collected,
Strongthon data	FANI		including data that includes the views of children
Strengthen data		· •	including data that includes the views of children
collection and maintain		strengthening its data collection and has	4) The 40 45 comments Original Original Comments for French and
disaggregated data to		already committed to improving the	1) The 10-15 year olds Crime Survey for England and
better understand the		recording of hate crimes, and developing	Wales should ask participants if they believe that the
scale and severity of		a better understanding of the scale and	incident was a hate crime in line with the Crime Survey for
hate crimes towards		severity of the problem in order to	England and Wales which surveys over 16s.
women, immigrants,		ensure that resources are allocated	
religious minorities,		appropriately.	
persons with disabilities,			
and children (United		As a first step, this year we published	
States of America)		analysis of data on the extent of and	
		perceptions towards hate crime from the	
		2009/10 and 2010/11 British Crime	
		Survey (BCS). The BCS asks people	
		about their experiences of crime in the	
		last 12 months, which are used to	
		estimate levels of crime in England and	
		Wales. As part of the BCS all victims are	
		asked if they believe that the incident	
		was a hate crime motivated by seven	
		different strands, including the five	
		strands that are monitored by criminal	
		justice agencies and then by age and	
		gender. The data demonstrates the	
		contrast between victims who have	
		experienced crime and those incidents	

that are reported to the police, and underlines the importance of our efforts to build victims' confidence to come forward.

At present published data on the nature of hate crime is not disaggregated further beyond the seven strands set out in response to recommendation 110.60, and does not include children under the age of 16 years. However, information gathered from incidents reported to police forces can also be used to identify trends and inform policing decisions.

We will continue to work with the relevant agencies to consider any other steps that could be taken to improve the collection of data relating to hate crime.

Scotland

In Scotland, data collect includes a variety of statistics about the number of convictions for aggravated crimes, including hate crimes relating to certain protected characteristics including religion, disability and sexuality.

Wales

The All Wales Hate Crime Research Project which is being led by Cardiff University and Race Equality First has

		received a three year Big Lottery Grant to undertake groundbreaking research which focuses on hate crime and hate related incidents across all recognised equality strands (age, disability, gender, race, religion and belief, sexual orientation and transgender status). The project aims to generate robust data on the prevalence, nature and impact of hate crime across Wales and to enhance communications, capacity building activities and information sharing about good practice in addressing hate crime.	
Special protection Measures			
110.94 Consider the possibility of raising the minimum criminal age and refrain from the practice of keeping children in custody (Belarus)	NO	The UK Government believes that children are old enough to differentiate between bad behaviour and serious wrong-doing at age 10. However we accept that prosecution is not always the most appropriate response to youth offending and the majority of offences committed by children (aged 10-14) are addressed using out of court disposals and robust intervention to prevent the re-	1) The Government takes concrete steps to ensure that children only receive custodial sentences as a matter of last resort and for the shortest possible time by raising the custody threshold. Short term sentences for children should be abolished. 2) The Government diverts children out of the criminal institution system by raising the minimum age of priminal.
		offending. Setting the age of criminal responsibility at age 10 in England and Wales allows frontline services to intervene early and robustly, preventing further offending and helping young people develop a sense of personal	justice system by raising the minimum age of criminal responsibility. 3) The Government commits, in its response to the <i>Transforming Youth Custody</i> consultation, to ensuring that those few children who are placed in custody are held in small, local institutions appropriate for their care and

responsibility for their behaviour.

Also see response to recommendation 110.87 on alternatives to custody for juvenile offenders.

Scotland

No child in Scotland under the age of 12 may be prosecuted for an offence. Nor can an older child be prosecuted for an offence committed when he or she was under 12. The law on prosecution of minors was last revised by the Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Act Scottish Ministers (2010).have committed to give fresh consideration to the age of criminal responsibility with a view to bringing forward further potential legislative changes during the current session of the Scottish Parliament (2011-16). On the issue of custody, the Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Act 2011 introduced provisions to end the very rare practice of remanding 14 and 15 year olds in prison. Accordingly, no legal mechanism exists for the courts to either remand or sentence a young person under age 16 to custody in prison.

rehabilitation, which are able to assess and meet all of a child's needs, staffed by well-trained and qualified multidisciplinary teams.

- 4) In relation to the treatment of children in custody, the Government must act to reduce restraint, segregation, self-harm, suicide and strip-searching and must ban the use of painful restraint techniques on children in custody.
- 5) Children should have access to adequate legal aid to allow them to challenge breaches of their rights in relation to custodial sentences and whilst in custody.
- 6) The Scottish Government should uphold its commitment to raising the age of criminal responsibility in line with the UN Committee's General Comment No. 10, during the current session of the Scottish Parliament (2011-16).

General Principles			
110.96 Ensure that the best interests of the child are taken into account when arresting, detaining, sentencing or considering early release for a sole or primary carer of the child, bearing in mind that visits of a parent in prison are primarily a right of the child rather than a privilege of the prisoner that can be withdrawn as a disciplinary measure (Slovakia)	YES	The Children Act 2004 provides a statutory framework in both England and Wales, requiring public bodies to make arrangements to safeguard and promote the welfare of children. The importance of supporting the children of offenders, both for their own sake and to prevent intergenerational crime, is recognised. Both prison and probation providers have duties under the Act, associated with either the child's right to contact with parents who are held in custody or with the safeguarding and wellbeing of children with whom they have contact. The National Offender Management Service (NOMS) service specifications set the minimum standards for Probation Trusts in delivery of Bail Services, Court Work and Assessment and all presentence reports require that information relating to risk and safeguarding of children is recorded and communicated to the relevant agencies There is an expectation that Probation Trust staff in courts, or when preparing reports, consider the parental or caring responsibilities of the offender and the impact of any sentencing proposals or advice given to the court.	Objective: In line with article 3 of the UNCRC, the best interests of the child should be a primary consideration when arresting, detaining, sentencing or considering the early release of a parent or primary carer of a child 1) The Government should ensure that protocols are developed and implemented to ensure that arrests are carried out in such a way as to minimise as far as possible trauma to children who are present or whose care may be disrupted. Police should always ask and record whether anyone (regardless of age or gender) who is arrested is the primary carer of a child. Police should also always ask whether any child will be left without immediate care as a result of the arrest and ensure that necessary arrangements are made for their safety. 2) The Families Left Behind http://www.familiesleftbehind.info/ service should be actively used at all courts to ensure that no child is left without immediate care as a result of detention or sentencing. 3) Where a child can no longer be cared for at home as a result of parental imprisonment, kinship care should be considered before other options. 4) Every prison should develop an action plan which actively seeks to promote and support strong family relationships, based on the Children and Families Pathway. They should maintain a dialogue between family

Prison Rules require prisons to actively encourage prisoners to maintain outside contacts and meaningful family ties. Visits are seen as crucial to sustaining relationships with partners and children and help prisoners maintain links with community. Un-convicted and convicted prisoners have a statutory right to a determined number of visits per month. However, if there are legal restrictions pertaining to access to children, safeguarding measures will be taken. NOMS provides the Assisted Prison Visits Scheme (APV) to provide financial help with travel expenses to prisoners' close relatives, children and escort to qualifying children where the visitor is on a low income. Governing Governors and Directors of Contracted Prisons must ensure that the APV scheme is widely advertised in: visitors centres, visit and/or waiting rooms and in the prison library. Prisoner induction programmes or similar must provide basic information about the APV scheme

Scotland

In Scotland, the welfare of the Child of a parent in the criminal justice system is of paramount importance and in some cases, there will be a need for a multirepresentatives and prison staff e.g. through a Family Forum, in order to support this plan.

- 5) NOMS should ensure that visits are recognised as a child's right and that family visits are available from the beginning of a prison sentence, do not have to be 'earned' by the prisoner and are not withdrawn as a means of disciplining a prisoner.
- 6) Family members should always have a chance to be involved in sentence planning throughout a prisoner's sentence and every effort should be made to involve carers and children in planning for release and managing resettlement.

Objective: Improve support for children with a parent in prison across the Scottish Government.

- 1) Use child and family impact assessments which should be conducted and acted upon throughout the criminal justice process in Scotland, starting with arrest and continuing through the release of a prisoner (including impact assessments for non-custodial penalties), which would further SCCYP's recommendations from the 2008 and 2011 reports 'Not Seen, Not Heard, Not Guilty.
- 2) The Scottish Government should support the Scottish Prison Service to continue the growing momentum to establish good quality, independently staffed prison visitors' centres at every prison in Scotland to support children and families of prisoners.

		agency approach, involving the police, social work and childcare professionals to carefully consider the child's needs, any views expressed by the child, and if required, consider and put in place suitable measures in order to protect the child.	 3) Ensure that Children's Visits (which are in high demand) are available for all prisoners in Scotland. 4) The Scottish Government should help to raise awareness throughout the statutory and voluntary sector of the impact of imprisonment on children and their roles and responsibility for addressing this, including amongst adult-focused services.
Basic health and Welfare			
110.101 Provide more resources for reforming the welfare	YES	The UK Government is reforming the welfare system through, among other measures, the introduction of Universal Credit (UC). UC will be clearer and	Objective: To ensure welfare reform does not have a negative impact on children, especially those children living in poverty
system in order to make it better able to tackle poverty and		simpler for claimants to understand, and will ensure that work always pays.	Ensure working age benefits keep pace with increases in the cost of living and increases in pay.
worklessness, and reduce negative impact on social vulnerable groups (Vietnam)		Through schemes like the Work Programme, we are providing more personalised back to work support for those at risk of long term	` .
		unemployment.	3) Improve Universal Credit so all recipients face improved work incentives under the new welfare system.
		We are also working to ensure that support for those who are unable to work, for example because of a disability, is better targeted and more sustainable in the long term, and that those who might be able to return to work in the near future are supported to do so. In addition, through early intervention and a focus on tackling the	

		causes of poverty, rather than the symptoms, the new Social Justice Strategy aims to empower those with the most severe and multiple disadvantages to make lasting changes to their lives. Scotland The Scottish Government agrees with the broad principles of the UK Government's welfare reforms plans, but recognises that work is not appropriate for everyone and that sufficient support should be available to those who need it. The Scottish Government agrees that welfare reform should take account of the needs of the poorest and most vulnerable people in society	
Education, leisure and cultural activities			
110.106 Adopt a strategy so that children of vulnerable groups are not excluded from the education system (Costa Rica)	YES	The UK Government is committed to developing policies that raise attainment for all children and close the gap between those facing disadvantage and their peers. Under the Equality Act 2010, in England the Department for Education has a legal duty to publish information to demonstrate compliance with the Public Sector Equality Duty of that Act; and the objectives under which we plan to foster fairness. The	Objective: All children have their right to an education realised irrespective of social group 1) Introduce a right of appeal for all children subject to the school exclusion process. 2) The exclusion threshold should be raised. 3) The duty in the Education Act 2008 requiring schools to invite and consider pupils' views in relation to certain matter should be brought into force.

objectives confirm that we will 'ensure that all children gain the knowledge they need to prepare them for adult life, through a reformed National Curriculum and more robust academic and vocational qualifications up to the age of 19. We shall be looking in particular for evidence of attainment of children with special educational needs, and those from minority ethnic communities that are currently under achieving. We shall support voung women and voung men to make informed choices, not limited by stereotypical thinking, by introducing a new duty on schools to secure access to independent and impartial careers guidance on the full range of post-16 education and training options'. We monitor progress through a range of evidence gathering mechanisms, including OFSTED and other published reports.

Scotland

The Scottish Government are committed to ensuring that all children and young people are able to make the most of the educational opportunities available to them to reach their potential. To achieve this, the Scottish Government are committed to supporting the implementation of the provisions of the

- 4) The new Statutory Guidance on exclusions should specify that the interests of the child concerned must be a primary consideration in exclusion decisions. Guidance to Independent Review Panels should also specify this as grounds for appealing against a permanent exclusion.
- 5) The Education Act 2011 should be amended to reinstate Independent Appeal Panels as they were constituted prior to the Act.
- 6) The Government should conduct research to identify the full extent of both lawful and unlawful exclusions and publish disaggregated data to show exclusions across disadvantaged children and their peers and across all protected characteristics, including more extensive data on the exclusion of children with SEN as part of its annual return on exclusions for both fixed-term and permanent exclusions.
- 7) The Education Funding Agency, the DfE and the Secretary of State must take action to ensure the accountability of academies in relation to exclusions
- 8) Guidance on managing in-house provision for excluded pupils should be developed, alongside guidance on commissioning all alternative provision.
- 9) The requirements for providers of ITT should include a requirement to prepare all NQTs to teach children in all their diversity, including with the full range of SEN and information in relation to child development and socio-

Equality Act 2010 which require schools to proactively prevent direct and indirect discrimination in relation to protected characteristics. In addition, we recognise that vulnerable children and young people may require support to enable them to realise their full potential. The Additional Support for Learning legislation provides the framework for children and young people who need additional support, for any reason, short or long term, to receive it to overcome barriers to their learning. Scottish education authorities must identify, provide for and keep under review the additional support needs for all children and young people for whose education they are responsible. The framework includes provisions for planning for learning, with support from other agencies, including health and social work services.

Wales

The Welsh Government begins from the position that children's educational interests are best served by attendance at school and we take steps to support children of vulnerable groups within schools. Where it is not possible to support a child at school, or families choose not to send their children to

psychological matters such as attachment theory. The DfE should produce guidance on the implementation of the equality duty with regard to exclusions.

- 10) The Pupil Premium should be ring-fenced.
- 11) There should increased ring-fenced investment in early years intervention.
- 12) There should be better collection and publication of disaggregated data which gives a full picture of the attainment gap, between children from disadvantaged backgrounds and their peers and across all protected characteristics, from the early years onwards.
- 13) The Scottish Government should use the *Curriculum* for *Excellence*, *Children and Young People Bill* and *National Parenting Strategy* to:
- Support parents in deprived areas to engage in their child's education;
- Provide affordable, high quality and extensive early education and care provision for all children in poverty from a young age; and
- Make sure that The Partnership Group set up to implement the recommendations of Teaching Scotland's Future should take into account the Common Core to ensure that any changes to teacher education are underpinned by children's rights.

mainstream schools, we provide additional support, for example through specialist units, home tuition and the operation of education welfare services.	14) With reference to Additional Support for Learning, the Scottish Government should ensure that the long-term plan to support the implementation of the Additional Support for Learning legislation:
	- addresses the need for specialist and adequate support for teachers in terms of learning support teachers, classroom assistants and links to other professionals;
	- includes an extensive monitoring and evaluation framework to build a national picture of the provision of additional support for learning to feed back into improving provision and developing practice; and
	- promotes Local authorities to ensure that all looked after children are considered for a CSP and that significantly more are given a CSP to support their learning.